



**SCIP-03: PROGRAM MANAGEMENT, PROJECT PREPARATION  
AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT FOR PLANNING AND  
DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT**

**ADB Loan No. 2499-PAK**

**PROGRESS REPORT  
DECEMBER 2011**



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page No
<b>1.</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Progress Report: December 2011	1
<b>2.</b>	<b>CONSULTANCY</b>	<b>1</b>
2.1	Contracts Status	1
2.2	Consultant's Staffing	2
	2.2.1 General	2
	2.2.2 Staff Present in Reporting Period	2
	2.2.3 Staff Mobilisation Against Personnel Schedule	2
	2.2.4 Consultant's Staffing Issues	2
	2.2.5 Consultant's Staffing in Next Reporting Period	3
2.3	Consultant's Office Arrangements	3
	2.3.1 New Office in Clifton	3
	2.3.2 Procurement of Additional Office Equipment	4
2.4	Meetings and Presentations	4
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROJECT PROGRESS AGAINST WORK PLAN</b>	<b>4</b>
3.1	<i>Item 1.2:</i> Procurement of Logistics and Facilities Required Consultant's Team	4
3.2	<i>Item 1.6:</i> Preparation of Inception Report (Final)	5
3.3	<i>Item 3.2:</i> Develop and Implement IPPMS for SCIP and Identify M&E Framework against the Action Plan	5
3.4	<i>Item 4.1:</i> Identification of Potential TMAs for Inclusion in Cluster	5
3.5	Preparation of Sub-Contracts under Provisional Sum	5
<b>4.</b>	<b>KEY ISSUES</b>	<b>6</b>
4.1	Confirmation of Towns to be Included as Beneficiaries in the Second Cluster (Central Sindh)	6
<b>5.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME OF ACTIVITIES FOR JANUARY 2012</b>	<b>6</b>

### APPENDICES

Appendix A	Personnel Schedules
Appendix B	Meeting Records
Appendix C	Work Plan

## 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Progress Report: December 2011

This report is the Monthly Progress Report of the Consultant's activities on SCIP-03 for the month of December 2011, as prepared by the Consultant, BCE.

The Consultant worked on finalizing quotations for furniture and office equipment for the new office in Clifton, submitting to the PSU with a view to gaining swift approval to permit a move from the PSU office early in the new year.

The Consultant's Inception Report (Final) was submitted to the PSU on 3<sup>rd</sup> December, comments duly received on 16<sup>th</sup> December, and a meeting held to discuss actioning these comments on 21<sup>st</sup> December.

Following a successful presentation to the PSU, the Monitoring & Evaluation Specialist submitted his draft M&E Strategy Report and started preparation of the final report.

The formulation of questionnaire for the baseline studies, commenced in November, was completed in this reporting period.

Good progress was also made on the preparation of press adverts for obtaining EOIs from suitable firms for both mapping studies and baseline studies, adverts for the former appearing in the press before month's end.

The international Team Leader demobilized on 22<sup>nd</sup> December for a four weeks leave period, whilst both national staff Deputy Team Leader and M&E Specialist provided continuous inputs. The MSD/Low Income Specialist completed a two week input (started in November) early in the month.

## 2. CONSULTANCY

### 2.1 Contract Status

Consulting services for SCIP-03 are being provided in accordance with the Consultancy Agreement of May 2010 between the Program Support Unit (PSU), Planning & Development Department, Government of Sindh and BCE, in association with SMEC International (SMEC) Pty Ltd (Australia) and Engineering General Consultants (EGC) Pvt Ltd (Pakistan). Consultancy services commenced on 5<sup>th</sup> of July 2010, and were planned to extend to 30<sup>th</sup> of June 2012, the end of ADB Loan 2499-PAK, as agreed at the contract negotiation meeting in Karachi on 4<sup>th</sup> March 2010. No further work was carried out on the original contract by BCE after the demobilization of the Team Leader and completion of his first input on 8<sup>th</sup> November 2010, pending the formation, agreement and signing of Amendment No. 1 on 12<sup>th</sup> July 2011, and the re-mobilisation of staff in late October 2011.

The Consultant's scope of work has four main areas of activity:

A1: Support the PSU in overall monitoring and evaluation of SCIP, and implementation of the SCIP Action Plan for Reform, including propelling the reform agenda and implementing province-wide policy, regulatory and institutional change.

A2: Identification and formation of Second Cluster in central Sindh including Incorporation, Formation and Legal Documentation of USC in Central Sindh.

A3: Mapping and Master Planning of Water Supply, Wastewater Management, Solid Waste Management Infrastructure; identification of potential Subprojects and project preparation; preparation of feasibility studies including preliminary designs for cost estimates of subprojects in each participating TMA of central Sindh cluster, Tranche 2.

A4: Support Urban Policy and Strategic Planning Unit on implementation initiatives and reforms.

## 2.2 Consultant's Staffing

### 2.2.1 General

The staffing schedule in Contract Amendment No.1 includes, for international staff, 36 person-months (7 personnel) and, for national staff, 122 person-months (23 personnel).

These staff are represented on the personnel schedule included in **Appendix A**. The schedule shows both contract person-months and the Consultant's proposals for a variation in inputs of some staff, as described in the Consultant's Inception Report (Final) [submitted 3/12/11].

### 2.2.2 Staff Present in Reporting Period

The Professional staff present during the reporting period are shown in the table below.

Name	Position	Mobilisation Date	Expected Demobilisation Date	Present During Reporting Period
Peter Griffiths (International)	Team Leader/ Institutional Reform and Municipal Serv Advisor	25/10/11	21/12/11	Part-time
Amjad Habib (National)	Deputy Team Leader/ MSE(WSS)	15/11/11	October 2012	Full-time
Farhan Sami Khan (National)	Monitoring & Evaluation Specialist	27/10/11	26/01/12	Full-time
Saeed-uz Zafar (National)	MSD / Low Income Unit Advisor	28/11/11	10/12/11	Part-time

### 2.2.3 Staff Mobilisation Against Personnel Schedule

With reference to the **Appendix A** personnel schedule, it can be seen that staff mobilisations were mainly on target in the reporting period. The exceptions were for Mapping/MIS Specialist and Contracts & Procurement Specialist, both of whom should have started in mid-December, but whose respective mobilisations have been deferred to January (see Section 2.2.4).

### 2.2.4 Consultant's Staffing Issues

#### *International Staff*

#### **BCE Proposals for Adjustment of Selected Staff Inputs (Inception Report)**

At the meeting of 21<sup>st</sup> December 2011 PSU confirmed that they require more detailed reasons for the input adjustments put forward by the Consultant in their Inception Report (Final). BCE agreed to this.

**Team Leader Leave**

PSU agreed to Team Leader Mr Peter Griffiths taking Christmas leave from 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2011 to 16<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

**Regional, Economic Planning and Urban Development Advisor**

PSU requested that BCE provide a second CV for this position, further to BCE's submission on 7<sup>th</sup> December of a CV for a Mr Requito Bellosillo as replacement for Mr Mal Horner (who left the project in August 2010). The Consultant agreed to supply, but pointed out to the PSU that the BCE Brisbane office Christmas/New Year close down from 23<sup>rd</sup> December 2011 to 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2012 would cause a nominal delay. .

*National Staff***BCE Proposals for Adjustment of Selected Staff Inputs (Inception Report)**

Also at the 21<sup>st</sup> December 2011 meeting, PSU requested that the Consultant provide more detailed reasoning before approval is given to the proposed adjustments in the Inception Report (Final).

**MIS/Mapping Specialist**

BCE agreed to home inputs by Mapping/MIS Specialist Mairaj Siddiqui, following a written request from BCE. The home inputs are necessary because Mr Siddiqui has found other employment. To avoid delays, PSU have agreed that Mr Siddiqui may input on SCIP-03 on a short-term basis whilst the Consultant finds a replacement.

The outsourcing of the mapping studies means less work for the Mapping Specialist on that task, but he is also due to provide a significant input as a member of the Urban Unit team (along with BCE's Regional, Economic Planning & Urban Development Advisor and the Urban Statistician).

**Contracts and Procurement Specialist**

Following CSC approval on 28<sup>th</sup> December of Mr Ali Imam Qadri as Contracts & Procurement Specialist, the Consultant hopes that ADB approval can be swift, to permit his mobilisation in early January.

**2.2.5 Consultant's Staffing in Next Reporting Period**

Planned mobilisations/demobilisations are:

- The mobilisation of Emmanuel Travino, BCE's Municipal Finance, Tariff & Regulatory Advisor [subject to PSU approval]
- The mobilisation of Mairaj Siddiqui, Mapping/MIS Specialist, on a 'home input' basis [subject to written approval from PSU].
- The mobilisation of Mr Ali Imam Qadri, Contracts Specialist [subject to ADB approval].
- The demobilisation from first input of M&E Specialist, Mr Farhan Sami Khan

**2.3 Consultant's Office Arrangements****2.3.1 New Office in Clifton**

As reported in the November MPR, the Consultant signed a one year lease agreement for a house in Clifton on 15<sup>th</sup> November.

During the reporting period the Consultant obtained quotations from three suppliers for furniture, air conditioners and other items and submitted the same to PSU for approval on 21<sup>st</sup> December 2011. On 31<sup>st</sup> December 2011 revised quotations were submitted, taking into account sales tax, following discussions with PSU accountants. .

The costs of the house rental and utility costs are covered by Out of Pocket Expenses (PKR) in Appendix E of Contract Amendment No. 1.

PSU has advised that the cost of furniture can be reclaimed under the 'Office Equipment' item in Out of Pocket Expenses.

### 2.3.2 Procurement of Additional Office Equipment

The Consultant obtained quotations for additional office equipment for the new Clifton office and submitted these to PSU for approval under a letter dated 21<sup>st</sup> December 2011. The additional equipment includes the following:

- Desktop computers & monitors (7 no.)
- Laser printer (1 no.)
- Colour injet printer (1 no)
- Scanners (2 no.)
- Fax machine (1 no.)
- Binding machine (1 no)
- Digital cameras (2 no.)

### 2.4 Meetings and Presentations with PSU

Formal meetings between BCE and PSU in the reporting period are shown in the table below (see **Appendix B**).

Date	Location	Meeting/ Presentation	Topic
01/12/11	Conference Room, PSU Office	Presentation by BCE	Presentation of draft M&E Strategy by BCE's M&E Specialist
21/12/11	PD's Room, PSU Office	Meeting	Table of comments of by PSU on BCE's Inception Report (Final), and BCE's response
29/12/11	Conference Room, PSU Office	Meeting	Draft M&E Strategy Report (16/12/11); baseline surveys; IPPMS and monitoring & reporting mechanisms; and procurement issues.

In addition, on 14<sup>th</sup>December, 2011, the Consultant's Deputy Team Leader and M&E Specialist attended part of a presentation by PSU's MIS Manager relating to the development of MIS for the PSU organisation.

## 3. PROJECT PROGRESS AGAINST WORK PLAN

The Consultant's Work Plan (**Appendix C**) shows a number of activities through December 2011. Progress on these is described below.

### 3.1 *Item 1.2: Procurement of Logistics and Facilities Required for Consultant's Team*

See Sections 2.3.1 & 2.3.2 above.

### **3.2 Item 1.6: Preparation of Inception Report (Final)**

The Consultant's Inception Report (Final) was substantially completed in the last reporting period, and formally submitted to PSU on 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2011. PSU comments were received on 16<sup>th</sup> December, and a meeting convened by PSU on 21<sup>st</sup> December to discuss BCE's response and proposed actions.

It was agreed at the 21<sup>st</sup> December 2011 meeting that BCE would revise the Inception Report, including, importantly, the work plan, and re-submit in January on the return from leave of the Team Leader.

### **3.3 Item 3.2: Develop and Implement IPPMS for SCIP and identify M&E Framework against the Action Plan**

Good progress was made on this activity in the reporting period. On 1<sup>st</sup> December 2011 BCE presented their draft M&E strategy to PSU; on 17<sup>th</sup> December 2011 BCE submitted their draft M&E Strategy Report to PSU; and on 29<sup>th</sup> December 2011 met with PSU staff to discuss their comments on the report.

In addition, revisions were made by BCE to the draft Key Performance Indicators (KPI) for the four broad components of IPPMS. Revisions were also made to the monitoring and evaluation framework outline, including monitoring and reporting mechanism. Further revisions to the M&E framework are expected to be made following the Consultant's planned meetings in early January with NSUSC officials in Sukkur.

### **3.4 Item 4.1: Identification of Potential TMAs for Inclusion in Cluster**

GOS is currently considering a change to the second cluster towns of central Sindh identified by PSU in 2010; a decision is expected in the next reporting period.

As soon as BCE is notified of the new towns (assuming there is a change), they will check compliance with ADB's selection criteria and advise the PSU accordingly.

### **3.5 Preparation of Sub-Contracts under Provisional Sum**

The Consultant and PSU agreed that the most urgent sub-contracts are the mapping studies and baseline studies.

Accordingly, the Consultant prepared for PSU approval advertisements for the submission of EOIs from interested companies to appear in the local press. Organised by the GOS Press & Information Department, an advert for mapping studies EOIs appeared in the Daily Dawn on 31<sup>st</sup> December 2011. A similar advert for baseline studies will appear in the same newspaper in the first week of January.

A draft Procurement Plan was discussed with PSU staff; this will be finalized in the next reporting period.

The agreed procedure is as follows: the best six EOIs to be determined by a PSU evaluation committee; these to be ratified by P&DD's CSC; these again to be ratified by ADB Manila; the best three EOI firms to be sent an RFP; negotiations to be entered into with the top evaluated EOI firm (the bid to include both technical & financial proposals); and in the event the technical bid is not satisfactory, the bid of the second ranked EOI firm will be opened; in the event that the second ranked EOI firm submit an unsatisfactory technical bid, the third ranked EOI firm bid will be opened.

The Consultant will mobilise their Contracts & Procurement Specialist in the next reporting period, subject to PSU and ADB approval.

#### **4. KEY ISSUES**

##### **4.1 Confirmation of Towns to be Included as Beneficiaries in the Second Cluster (Central Sindh)**

The Consultant notes that a decision on the identification of the second cluster towns has yet to be made by the GOS Chief Minister. [Refer to November MPR].

This delay affects certain important Consultant's activities, including finalization of the RFPs for the outsourced subcontracts for both mapping studies and baseline studies; and field visits to the towns by staff.

#### **5. PROGRAMME OF ACTIVITIES FOR JANUARY 2012**

The Consultant's activities for January 2012 will include the following:

- The ordering of furniture for the new office in Clifton [dependent on PSU and ADB approval to the quotations submitted by the Consultant]
- A visit to NSUSC, Sukkur, by Deputy Team Leader and M&E Specialist for the dual purpose of (a) checking monitoring and evaluation measures for Tranche 1; and (b) studying the NSUSC organization and structure to assist in the Consultant's role in setting up the CSUSC.
- Submission of draft final M&E Strategy Report
- Submission of updated project Work Plan
- Submission of revised final Inception Report
- Completion of the EOI approval process for mapping studies and baseline studies [prior to submission to P&DD's CSC and ADB]
- Progress on preparation of ToRs for the RFPs for both mapping studies and baseline studies
- The mobilisation of staff Emmanuel Travino, Mairaj Siddiqui and Ali Imam Qadri [refer to Section 2.2.4 above]





**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

in association with:



## MEETING RECORD

---

**Date & Time:** 29th December 2011, 3:00 PM

**Location:** PD's Room, PSU Office

**Purpose:** Presentation of M&E Strategy to the PSU and subsequent discussion relating to PSU comments on the Consultant's Strategy Report: Monitoring and Evaluation

**Present:**

Mr Saeed Ahmed Awan	- Program Director, PSU
Mr Rafique Mustafa Shaikh	- Deputy Program Director, PSU
Mr Muhammad Khalid	- Municipal Services Specialist, PSU
Mr Asghar Memon	- Program Officer M&E, PSU
Mr Amjad Habib	- Consultant's Acting Team Leader (SCIP-03)
Mr Farhan Sami Khan	- Consultant's Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist (SCIP-03)

**Minutes Prepared by:**

Amjad Habib and Farhan Sami

**Minutes Distribution:**

All participants

---

*The meeting started with the introduction of BCE staff to the new Program Director (PD), PSU-SCIP, Mr Saeed Ahmed Awan. After the introduction, the Consultant's Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist presented the program's overall Monitoring and Evaluation strategy. This was followed by a discussion on the tabulated PSU comments relating to the earlier delivered draft Consultant's Strategy Report: Monitoring and Evaluation.*

**Attachment A:** This shows PSU's comments on the Consultant's draft M&E Strategy Report and the agreement on each point as reached between the two parties.

**Attachment B:** This shows comments by the Regional Specialist-PSU (Sukkur based), and subsequent agreement between PSU and the Consultant.

### 1. Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy: Baseline Surveys, IPPMS, and Monitoring and Reporting of Data

1.1 At a prior meeting it had been agreed between the Consultant and PSU's MSE, that there is no need for the SCIP-03 consultant to conduct baseline studies for the north Sindh cluster towns. This was based on the rationale that specific sub-projects under ICB and NCB have already been identified and initiated, whereas others are in progress. Therefore in technical terms it cannot be considered as a baseline but instead, it will be a monitoring exercise. At that meeting, it was also decided that the baseline on physical implementation will not be carried out in both north and central Sindh cluster towns. Instead, the Assets and Inventories Survey (which will serve the same purpose) will be substituted for the baseline survey for Central Sindh cluster towns. This may be termed as the baseline for physical assets. The survey exercise will be performed by a firm which will prepare the list of transferable assets along with their financial valuations.

1.2 Consultant MMP has been assigned the responsibility to conduct the baseline surveys for the North Cluster, which was previously assumed to be the responsibility of SCIP-03 Consultants. Based on the review of revised TORs for the SCIP-03 Consultant, clarification is required to identify the



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



consulting firm which will be responsible for conducting the baseline surveys earlier designed by the SCIP-03 Consultant. The matter will be discussed with NSUSC during the planned Sukkur visit of PSU management and the SCIP-03 Consultant, from 4<sup>th</sup> to 6<sup>th</sup> January, 2012.

- 1.3 The response rate provided in the formula for determining the sample size with known population was 90 percent. The SCIP-03 Consultant will ensure a 100 percent response rate. This means that total sample size determined and finalised for the survey will be covered during data collection by the sub-contracted research firm.
- 1.4 The baseline questionnaires for households and non-household customers will be translated both in Sindhi and Urdu for facilitation of data collection during both surveys.

## **2. Results of SCIP-03 Consultancy Discussion**

- 2.1 The Consultant will revise the detailed work plan in January. The SAMAs for Central cluster towns will be prepared in such a fashion to remove the shortcomings of the previous agreements (version), as signed between the NSUSC and the TMAs.
- 2.2 It was agreed during the meeting that the Consultant's water supply specialist, wastewater engineer and MSE (SWM) will prepare manpower requirements for Minimum Service Standards in providing water supply, wastewater management and solid waste management services.
- 2.3 There is no detailed mapping required by the TORs of solid waste management (SWM). Therefore incorporation of information is required in the RFPs for making a solid waste management plan in the mapping studies for Central Sindh towns. Saadat Ali, the Consultant's MSE (SWM) will be responsible for the activities concerning the planning of SWM for the Central Sindh cluster. He will be assisted for two man-months by an international MSE(SWM).
- 2.4 The Consultant's Mapping/MIS Specialist, Mairaj Siddiqui, will be assigned home inputs relating to the mapping exercise for which a letter of approval will soon be issued by the PSU.
- 2.5 The Consultant has put forward the CV of Mr Requito Bellosillo as replacement of Mal Horner as Regional, Economic Planning & Urban Development Advisor. Once a second CV is submitted, it is expected that a P&DD CSC meeting will approve Mr Requito.

## **3. General Discussion**

- 3.1 The administrative procedures for procurement of furniture and other office items are currently being expedited by the PSU. This will assist the SCIP-03 Consultant in relocating to the new office.

**The meeting was closed at 5:00PM**



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



## Attachment A: Table of PSU Comments on Draft M&E Strategy Report, and Results of Discussions between Consultant and PSU

	PSU Comments	Results of Discussions with PSU
1	Page 1, the first paragraph of the Background requires little strengthening and requires brief discussion over bringing in new Cluster Approach Urban Services Corporation Model	One additional paragraph will be added in the background based on the New Cluster approach of the USC Model.
2	1.2.1, Discuss with the account officer-SCIP about the new role of SCIP-01 Consultants and update in report	When the new role of SCIP-01 will be available which is under discussion, it will be received from PSU and subsequently incorporated into the Consultant's Strategy Report: Monitoring and Evaluation.
3	1.2.4, SCIP 4 consulting firm role as defined in broad tasks, requires elaboration	The summarised version of detailed tasks of SCIP-04 will be incorporated in the Report.
4	There is a huge confusion in Tranche 02 and Tranche 03, discussion is required among the PSU and BCE for clear understanding of Tranches and to finalize the M&E Strategy	The geographical areas of the program will be written Cluster wise for the purpose of identifying the towns instead of Tranches (such as Tranche I and II).
5	Section 1.3 Tranche II will cover Tranche I towns and six additional towns in central Sindh is totally wrong statement.	Rephrasing of term based on Clusters.
6	Section 2.2, i) in place of North and Central Towns of Sindh, may be corrected as North Cluster and upcoming Central and South Clusters in Sindh.	Same as above.
7	Chart I: The outline is comprehensive but there is a dire need to fix individual responsibilities at PSU, NSUSC and upcoming USC to share and input information.	Individual responsibilities cannot be assigned in the Report. It is the institutional responsibility to assign the duties to individuals.
8	Page 07, i) (d) yes electronic IPPMS is required	Agreed. It will be removed from the sentence.
9	Page 07, iii) Training and sharing KPIs with NSUSC is very critical and a presentation may be given by M&E specialist of BCE to NSUSC for feedback and finalization of Monitoring system with NSUSC on behalf of PSU.	This matter will be discussed in detail during SCIP-03 Consultants and PSU visit to Sukkur and subsequent meetings with NSUSC on the 04-05 January.
10	Page 07, iii) (b) in addition, The NSUSC will also share Maps, Master	Done.



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



	Plans, Business Plans and Consultants and Contractors progress reports with PSU-SCIP	
11	Page 09, Para 01 line number 03, according to the Program Documents the sequence of the services are Water Supply, Wastewater Management and Solid Waste Management please use the said sequence for defining SCIP interventions / services	Done.
12	Page 09, b. industries shall also be included in the proposed list of potential surveys for Urban Municipal Services	Done. Besides the report, the questionnaire for non-household customers will include a specific section for Industries.
13	Ensure availability and input of Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist of BCE to carry out the entire work of surveys till the development and approval of Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy and IPPMS system.	This is not a report comment.
14	M&E Specialist of BCE shall be the main focal person for imparting trainings to the Enumerators and trainings to the key official of PSU, NSUSC to carry out the exercise in a professional way.	This is not a report comment.
15	There is a dire need to re-evaluate the section 5.1 Structure and Operations Monitoring and Reporting Framework (Confusing USC and NSUSC Concepts) USC and Regional Offices concept clearance to consultants is required	Section 5.1 will be revised based on the coherent understanding of the USC concept discussed in detail during the December 29, 2012 meeting between PSU and SCIP-03 Consultants.
16	Discussion required on (d) of 2.3.1. Baseline on Present Status of Physical Implementation the paragraph is not clear	The Baseline on Present Status of Physical Implementation will not serve the purpose of baseline for Physical Assets particularly in the North Cluster towns. Therefore, the Mapping studies and Assets and Inventories survey will provide the basis for baseline of Central Clusters.
17	Page 11, Table 2, the proposed number of household for Tranche I and Tranche II has quiet big difference. Well PSU understanding is the sample size for the central cluster should be on larger scale, as we are starting the cluster while the northern cluster is already being initiated. Calculations checks highlighted that only 03 towns are considered for Survey for Tranche II.	The determination of sample size for North and Central Clusters is based on the estimated population sizes (Most North Cluster towns have higher population sizes than Central Cluster towns). The sample selected is representative based on discrete probability selection. However, the description of the sampling methodology will be more elaborated in the revised report for more clear understanding.
18	Page 11, last line will be (written twice), please correct	Done.

Head Office: Level 1, 60 Leichhardt Street, PO Box 1038, Spring Hill, Q 4004 Australia, Tel: +61 7 3230 3690, Fax: +61 7 3230 3699 E. Web: [www.bce.com.au](http://www.bce.com.au)

Pakistan Office: 49-D-1, Gulberg III, Lahore – 54660, Pakistan, Tel: +92 42 35754751, Facsimile: +92 42 35760030, Email: [ahsam.arshad@smec.com](mailto:ahsam.arshad@smec.com)



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



19	KPIs for Sub Component I Service Delivery, the KPI is good but the names of Towns (Khairpur and Rohri) are provided, the names may be removed. In SWM section KPI # 04, number of contractors information is not sufficient, it information may be required at UC level and service provided by each contractor to number of households or total length of roads outsourced for sweeping to various contractors.	Targets for sewage flows in Khairpur and Water Supply for Rohri have been particularly identified in ADB DMF. The KPI #4 for SWM will be revised accordingly.
20	Table 7, KPI Water Supply and wastewater, first 03 KPIs requires discussion	The first three KPIs on Reliability of Water Supply and Wastewater do not require information from households. Instead, they measure the reliability of services provision from the services providers. The remaining KPIs will acquire information from the households.
21	Table 9: In institutional Reforms information may be elaborated to (Number of Engineers, Supervisors, Line Man and other per 1000 household) similar for Wastewater Management. This will give a reflection of staff strength on population or household's number.	There will be further inclusion of KPIs for institutional reform.
22	Table 10: Discussion required.	The KPIs for Physical Implementation of newly constructed projects is an evolving process which is dependent on the nature and kind of sub-projects of municipal services. Therefore, it is difficult to standardise the KPIs in accordance to the diversity of sub-projects under each municipal service. They will be designed according to the specific activities of each sub-project. This will be mentioned clearly in the footnote. Some indicators may be developed by the M&E specialist so that M&E specialist could follow and develop as and when required.
23	Section 4, Para 1 of page 24, Confusing sentence, NSUSC and CSUSC responsibilities are mixed.	Section 4 will be revised according to the clear understanding of institutional functions and their specific roles and responsibilities.
24	A meeting is required among the Bearing Point and BCE in the presence of PSU to check the status of Complaints system and other works	This meeting will be conducted during SCIP-03 Consultants and PSU visit to Sukkur with Bearing Point January 05, 2011
25	Section 5 and Section 5.4: The responsibilities of NSUSC is confusing, there is no linkage between USC and NSUSC. The linkages are between the NSUSC head office and NSUSC regional offices at all municipalities	Section 5 will be revised based on the clarified concept of USC models for North, Central and South Clusters.



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



	(Sukkur, Rohri, Larkana, Shikarpur and Khairpur). Please discuss	
26	Annex C D-III add the following questions in the Questionnaire  a. Do you have dust bins at home b. Do you sell (paper, plastic, glass, iron and other recyclable items) to scavengers c. If yes, amount per month -----	Done.
27	Annex D, add icon for Industry and its type in Q.03	Separate set of questions will be incorporated in the baseline questionnaire for non-household customers.
28	Annex D, add Bottle Water Icon in Question 2(a)	Done.
29	Annex D, 3) Add NSUSC icon if the survey is being carried out in NSUSC coverage areas	There is an apparent confusion in the baseline surveys about NSUSC. It is important to note that all information in the baselines for Northern Cluster will be asked before the establishment and service provision role of NSUSC. Otherwise, it would not be technically a baseline survey.
30	Annex D. Section E Add a question, do you know about the Hospital Waste Management Rules, 2005 prepared by Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency.	Done.
31	Annex E Question 2.5, the question may be tabulated and ask separately. The form to acquire the information may be developed; the senior Municipal officer shall fills in the Human Resource Information available in the Municipality. Verify the details, and provide PSU a signed copy. This is very critical to know the actual number of staff working in Water Supply, Wastewater Management and Solid Waste Management to prepare SAMAs and the first Business and Operational Plan of upcoming Central Urban Services Corporation	All the information taken from TAs relating to human resources, assets and their valuation, finance, and others will be taken from published records kept at the administration. The enumerator will fill the TA questionnaire based on this record also providing the SCIP-03 consultants with the record he/she may have acquired from the town administrations, signed by the administrator.
32	Annex E: Section 3 question 3.1 need correction, question 3.2 to 3.11 requires restructuring – please discuss, section 3(b) WASTEWATER requires restructuring of questionnaires	Annex E is to be shared with the MSS. If there are any written comments on revising section 3, they will be incorporated after discussion.
33	After question 2.6 and 2.7, a question may be asked how much the	It may be asked but requires a logical justification for such a question.



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



	municipalities are interested to outsource the services.	
	<b>CONCLUSION</b>	
34	The overall quality of report is good report reflects that M&E Specialist works very hard to prepare –Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy and IPPMS for Sindh Cities Improvement Program.	Noted.
35	The first draft of M&E submitted to PSU-SCIP on the December 17, 2011. A meeting / presentation over the draft report is expected after incorporation of these comments and discussions with the PSU team to formulate strategy and finalize IPPMS.	Noted.
36	These are initial comments; PSU may share comments and suggestions during the presentation.	Noted.



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



## Attachment B: Comments on Draft M&E Strategy Report by PSU's Regional Specialist (Mr Maqsood Bhatti)

Page No.	Strategy Report Reference	Comments of Regional Specialist	Consultant's Comments
5	i) Multiple baseline surveys for collecting benchmark data	Does this survey cover the data of people perception before taking over of NSUSC?	The baseline surveys will collect information prior to establishment and subsequent services provision by NSUSC.
7	i) (a) Sub-contract baseline studies for 12 towns ii) (a) Provide training relating to KPIs, IPPMS and data collection requirements to the personnel of USC after their establishment. Subsequently, the USC will report periodic monitoring data to NSUSC before its submission to PSU.	i) This does not include 02 towns of Tranche II in NSUSC  ii) Is this USC Regional Office of NSUSC in participating towns or new cluster, and is there any reporting line for new USC is to NSUSC and then to PSU.	As discussed previously with PSU, the reporting mechanism will be revised based on the newly understood and coherent understanding of the general institutional framework.
16	Table 5: Components and Sub-components of IPPMS	Could we put here the sub-component of capacity building of staff for efficient reporting from NSUSC and other USCs.	This will be incorporated in Table 12 instead of Table 5.
17	Table 6: KPI for Service Delivery of Water supply, wastewater and SWM	Before asking for change in total volume of contracted services; couldn't it be better to know the existing volume of these services and fit some questions for that in the baseline survey questionnaires.	The total volumes of water supply, waste water generated, and solid waste collected are already present in the TA questionnaire (before the NSUSC). The change will measure the difference after NSUSC took over. It will be measured through the IPPMS.
19	Table 8: SWM – Frequency of sweeping streets and roads per	The drainage system is also a component of sanitation. In the participating towns of NSUSC,	Based on the combined system of sewer and drainage (as mentioned), KPIs can be included



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



	week	100% households are not connected to the sewerage lines directly. The open drainage is being de-silted and household toilets are connected to the open surface drains. Even on the main roads, the rain drains are also connected to the households using all type of waste disposal. Would it be better if we add here the frequency of cleaning and de-silting of open surface drains per week and level of customer's satisfaction or otherwise for complaint redressal ?	concerning the frequency of cleaning and de-silting of these sewer cum drainage lines.
20	Table 9: Tariff adjustments, collection and cost recovery	We could add here the component of cost-effectiveness like % decrease in operational / repair & maint: costs. Also we can see the optimal utilization of resources.	It will be incorporated.
39	Annex B: List of Towns Tranche II	Table A3.2 in RRP indicates about Tranche II towns in the Northern Sindh in addition to existing 6 clustered towns.	As previously discussed, it will be changed according to Clusters. The reference of towns with respect to tranches will be removed.
40	Annex C:	4. Education Level: Option No. viii) Others (Specify) may be added subject to respondent or any of his family member possesses Diploma or Ph.D degrees etc. 5. Tenure Status: In case of rented premises – Amount of Rent and Advance may be added.	The Other (specify) option takes into account this information.
44	Annex C: D -1: What is the main source of water used by your household for drinking, cooking and other purposes?	Two or more options can be ticked in responding this Q.	The Other (specify) option takes into account this information.
45	Do you treat water to make it safer for drinking?	This Q may be asked only for the tap water supplied from municipal or company. In case, if	



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



	<p>Who fetches water: Before knowing people's satisfaction level, we may add three Qs'</p> <p>If people are dissatisfied or highly dissatisfied, then, Q may be asked:</p>	<p>people buy water for drinking and cooking, then they may be asked about the price of that water. Add option: v) Other (servant or otherwise) - Do you have adequate water supply throughout the year? i) Yes. ii) No - If (No), Do you face water shortage problem during; i) Winter, ii) Summer iii) Both - How many days do you think do you face during; i) Winter _____, ii) Summer _____, iii) Both _____ - How often your complaint is being heard &amp; addressed? i) Regularly, ii) occasionally, iii) Other (Plz specify) _____</p>	<p>The problem of water shortages has already been asked in the TA questionnaire.</p> <p>The question does not hold good because the questions will be asked prior to service provision by NSUSC.</p>
46	D-III: Accessibility, reliability & quality of sanitation: After knowing people's perception / satisfaction level, we may add Questions about complaint.	<p>How often your complaint is being heard &amp; addressed? i) Regularly, ii) occasionally, iii) Other (Plz specify) _____</p>	The baseline survey is seeking information before the service provision of NSUSC. Therefore, it is not appropriate to ask this question.
48	E. Health & Environment:	<p>We may add 2 Qs' – (1) Do you know, if solid waste / garbage is not being collected on time, how it will affect badly to the city environment and what diseases can spread due to this? a) Yes, b) No</p>	This is not an appropriate question to be asked from households particularly about the type of diseases which could spread. A health professional may be the right person to give such an information not the respondent from a household.
51	1(f) If water is bought other than Municipal, then Q may be asked	How much do you pay per month for the water bought from other sources? _____	It will be changed accordingly.
63	4.2 Customer Complaint, Grievances	Bifurcated data on complaint redressal may be sought; e.g. No. of complaints received in water supply sector during the year _____, No.	The Customer Complaints Grievances System was introduced by NSUSC. The information is being asked prior to NSUSC taking over the municipal



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



		<p>of complaints addressed in water supply sector during the year _____ No. of complaints received in wastewater sector during the year _____, No. of complaints addressed in wastewater sector during the year _____ No. of complaints received in SWM sector during the year _____, No. of complaints addressed in SWM sector during the year _____</p>	<p>service delivery function.</p>
--	--	---	-----------------------------------



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

in association with:



---

## MEETING RECORD

---

**Date & Time:** 21 December 2011, 11.45 AM

**Location:** PD's Room, PSU Office

**Purpose:** Meeting to discuss BCE's Inception Report (Final)

**Present:**

Mr. Abdul Kabir Kazi	- Program Director, PSU
Mr. Mr. Rafique Mustafa Shaikh	- Deputy Program Director, PSU
Mr Muhammad Khalid	- Municipal Services Engineer, PSU
Mr Peter Griffiths	- Consultant's Team Leader
Mr Amjad Habib	- Consultant's Deputy Team Leader
Mr Farhan Sami Khan	- Consultant's Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist

**Minutes Prepared by:**

Peter Griffiths

**Minutes Distribution:**

All participants, BCE, SMEC, EGC Lahore

---

*This meeting record includes an attachment. This is a table composed of three columns: PSU comments (27 points raised) of 16<sup>th</sup> December on the Consultant's IR(Final); BCE's response to those comments; and the agreement reached on each point at the 21<sup>st</sup> December meeting.*

### 1. Meeting Format

- 1.1. The purpose of the meeting was to discuss BCE's Inception Report (Final) [submitted 3/11/11] by focussing on PSU's formal comments on the report of 9/12/11 [as received by BCE on 16/12/11].
- 1.2. Prior to the meeting BCE had finalised a response to each of PSU's comments and these were presented in a two column table for discussion at the meeting. Copies were handed to all present at the start of the meeting.
- 1.3. Subsequent to the meeting, BCE added a third column to this table with a draft of agreements reached on each of PSUs 27 comments. This is included as an attachment to these draft minutes.
- 1.4. During the meeting other points beside the 27 comments in PSU's 9/12/11 list were discussed, most relating to staffing issues. These are summarised below.

### 2. General Agreements at Meeting (with reference to attached table)

- 2.1 With reference to the attached table, BCE agreed to action the agreed points as soon as practicable. The majority will be done by the team leader on his return from his leave on 16<sup>th</sup> January 2012. The first point, on the hybrid approach, where PSU have requested BCE provide options, will be actioned by BCE's CEO, Mr Jonathan Powell in the new year [BCE's Brisbane office is closed from 24/12/11 to 2/01/12 (incl)].



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



## **3. BCE Staffing Issues**

### **3.1 Home & Field Inputs**

- 3.1.1 PSU agreed that national staff will be allowed to input with 'home' inputs where appropriate. BCE to notify PSU of approximate dates in each case.
- 3.1.2 BCE also agreed that international staff will be permitted to input with 'home' inputs when appropriate. These inputs to be agreed on a case by case basis.

### **3.2 BCE Proposed Adjustments to Staff Inputs – National Staff**

- 3.2.1 The PSU indicated that for agreement to BCE's proposed adjustments to inputs for some personnel, as presented in Section 7 of the Inception Report, more reasoning needs to be given by the Consultant.

### **3.3 BCE Proposed Adjustments to Staff Inputs – International Staff**

- 3.3.1 As already recorded in the attached table, PSU require more reasoning before they will agree to increasing the input of the team leader from 9 to 11 months, as proposed in Section 7 of the Inception Report. BCE to amend Section 7 of the IR accordingly.
- 3.3.2 The PSU said that they had noted that although the Municipal Finance, Tariff & Regulatory Advisor has inputted 2.3 months in 2010, there appeared to be no output. PSU said that they therefore expect his input in 2012 to be shortened accordingly, with no decrease in his overall outputs, as contractually defined.
- 3.3.3 The PSU told BCE that the total remuneration figure for international staff (Contract Amendment No. 1, App D) is a ceiling limit only, and can be less if circumstances warrant.

## **4. Central Cluster Towns**

- 4.1 BCE informed the PSU that they urgently require official confirmation of the towns to be included in the second cluster. The Consultant said that without this information no further progress can be made on the baseline surveys and mapping studies TOR preparations.

## **5. Tranche 2 Designation for Central Cluster Towns**

- 5.1 At the meeting PSU asked BCE to change all references to Tranche 2 to Tranche 3 in accordance with the fact that the designation 'Tranche 2' has been given to the additional work on Tranche 1 towns in north Sindh.
- 5.2 The Consultant said that they are willing to do this, but said that because Tranche 2 is specifically mentioned on the Terms of Reference of Contract Amendment No. 1, they will require a formal written instruction. The PSU agreed to provide this, but need firstly to check with the ADB.

**The meeting was closed at 1.15PM**

## ATTACHMENT TO MEETING RECORD of 21<sup>st</sup> DECEMBER 2011

**Table Showing: PSU Comments on BCE Inception Report (Final), BCE Response and 21/12/11 PSU/BCE Meeting Agreement**

Nr	PSU Comment (9/12/11)	BCE Response	21/12/11 PSU/BCE Meeting Agreement
1.	<p>Para 2.4 Contracting arrangements, BCE Proposes to modify the SCIP-03 component to that of a hybrid approach. This approach will maintain the existing time-based payment system, with a proportion of monthly invoicing retained and applied to the supply of project deliverables. <b><i>BCE is required to prepare 03 options for the proposed arrangements and discuss with PSU.</i></b> Also BCE should elaborate on the justification for hybrid approach based on the modification of ToRs and Scope of Work.</p>	<p>The hybrid approach is proposed based on the modification of the ToR from a project component focused on institutional strengthening and PSU support (time orientated) to one that is focused on mapping and feasibility studies (output orientated). The hybrid contracting model aims to provide better outcomes for the PSU by incentivising the BCE team to ensure project outputs are delivered on schedule.</p>	<p>PSU in agreement to BCE response. However, PSU requested that BCE translate their comment into a proposed new formal payment structure, this being a mutually agreeable combination of time based payments and (report) deliverables payments.</p>
2.	<p>Table 2.4, discussion required to come to a conclusion for carrying mapping survey for water and wastewater management together with Asset Inventory Survey. The firm qualifies for carrying out mapping exercise would also prepare Asset Inventory Survey with a prescribed format provided by BCE. The firm will prepare a Survey Report including mapping and asset information. It was discussed in the meeting on November 03,</p>	<p>As reflected in Tables 2.4 &amp; 2.5 of the Inception Report (Final), the subcontract for the assets inventory will be separate from the mapping studies subcontract. For the latter, the ToR will follow the Terms of Reference.</p> <p>BCE note that the minutes of the 3/11/11 meeting do not refer to a discussion on asset drawings as such. In any case they are not required for the production of the SAMAs.</p>	<p>It was agreed that because the asset inventory surveys require complete valuations of the assets and inventories, this is not a role the mapping studies firms can undertake. Instead, specialist firm(s) will be needed to carry out this activity. BCE to continue on this basis.</p> <p>It was also agreed by PSU that detailed drawings are not needed for the SAMAs.</p>



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

in association with:



**SMC International  
Pty Ltd, Australia**



**Engineering General Consultants  
EGC (Pvt) Ltd., Pakistan**

	<p>2011 to prepare the missing asset drawings by the same firm hired for survey. The same will be included in the Mapping and Surveys, EOIs and TORs.</p>														
<p>3.</p>	<p>Table 2.5 Reporting Requirements is well prepared by BCE, however submission dates for some reports are different from the dates agreed with PSU in meeting held on November 03, 2011, and this creates confusion and will delay the whole exercise of preparation of PFR to get TRANCHE-2 funding. Discuss and redraft the Work Plan accordingly.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="241 831 734 1383"> <thead> <tr> <th><i>Report</i></th> <th><i>Date (s) of Submission</i></th> <th><i>Date (s) committed with PSU</i></th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Draft Sub-Project Feasibility Report</td> <td>31/07/2012</td> <td>15/06/2012</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Final Sub-Project Feasibility Studies Report</td> <td>31/08/2012</td> <td>15/07/2012</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Subproject</td> <td>31/08/2012`</td> <td>31/06/2012</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	<i>Report</i>	<i>Date (s) of Submission</i>	<i>Date (s) committed with PSU</i>	Draft Sub-Project Feasibility Report	31/07/2012	15/06/2012	Final Sub-Project Feasibility Studies Report	31/08/2012	15/07/2012	Subproject	31/08/2012`	31/06/2012	<p>On reviewing the Work Plan discussed at the 3/11/11 meeting, BCE note that the following dates were included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1.Draft Subproject Feasibility Report submission: mid-July 2012</li> <li>2.Final Subproject Feasibility Report submission: mid-August 2012</li> <li>3.Subproject Appraisal Report: not included in the version shown at the meeting</li> <li>4.Periodic Financing Request (PFR): mid-July</li> </ol> <p>The Work Plan included in the IR (Final) has similar dates to that Work Plan for (1) &amp; (2) – just 0.5 months later for each. For (4) the new date of 30/09/12 reflects the insertion of ‘Summary Subprojects Appraisal Report’ in the new version. A PFR cannot be produced and submitted to ADB until ADB have formally approved that report, as submitted by GOS.</p>	<p>It was agreed that BCE and PSU will agree a revised Work Plan on the return of BCE’s team leader from leave on 16<sup>th</sup> January 2012.</p> <p>BCE acknowledged PSU’s concern that it is vital the PFR be submitted to ADB in time for full approval of tranche financing before the end of 2012. At the meeting BCE said that the contractual need for draft and final FSRs means that the important Summary Subprojects Appraisal Report, ADB approval of which leads to a PFR, cannot, on the current program, be delivered before August 2012. As ADB will need time to review, and may require some changes, a realistic earliest PFR submission date, according to BCE, is September 2012.</p> <p>PSU said that to speed up the process, it is their intention to arrange with ADB for a consultant to be appointed under a new TA to review BCE’s Summary Subproject Appraisal Report on behalf of GOS.</p>
<i>Report</i>	<i>Date (s) of Submission</i>	<i>Date (s) committed with PSU</i>													
Draft Sub-Project Feasibility Report	31/07/2012	15/06/2012													
Final Sub-Project Feasibility Studies Report	31/08/2012	15/07/2012													
Subproject	31/08/2012`	31/06/2012													



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)

Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



**SMC International  
Pty Ltd, Australia**



**Engineering General Consultants  
EGC (Pvt) Ltd., Pakistan**

	Appraisal Report				
	Periodic Financing Request	30/09/2012	15/07/2012		
4.	Para 3.2.5, PSU-SCIP is providing day to day input for the finalization of EOIs and TORs preparation for various surveys highlighted in Table 2.4.	BCE do not see the two things as being related and request that the sub-section be allowed to stand unaltered		PSU agreed no need for any change	
5.	Correction required on Para 3.2.7, PSU is not planning to change the current organizational arrangement – BCE has reviewed the PSU structure and suggest changes.	BCE will re-word this sub-section.		Agreed at meeting	
6.	3.3.4 Para 2 Needs to be rephrased as: six towns selected in consultation with the SCIP 3 consultants on the basis of criteria set out in the loan agreement	Agreed will re-write		Agreed at meeting	
7.	Discussion required to develop and implement a PSU capacity development and training plan	BCE plan to commence this activity in the New Year and involve a range of staff. We therefore request that the sub-section be allowed to remain unaltered. BCE will re-word this sub-section.		The work on the capacity building and training plan will begin in January 2012 with the return of the Team Leader and mobilisation of BCE's Municipal Finance, Tariff and Regulatory Advisor. PSU require BCE to provide training manuals as part of this task.	



**Brisbane City  
Enterprises Pty Ltd.**

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

*in association with:*



**SMC International  
Pty Ltd, Australia**



**Engineering General Consultants  
EGC (Pvt) Ltd., Pakistan**

8.	Correct Para No 03 of page 4-2 (Organization Structure of PSU) as suggested for Para 3.2.7	BCE will re-word	Agreed at meeting
9.	Para # 03 of the report Page 4-5 highlights that, PSU identified six towns in Central Sindh for inclusion in the second cluster, this is not properly communicated in the report. PSU does not identify the towns; the towns are selected based on the Criteria for selection of TMAs for town Cluster. Correction of words are required in report.	BCE wl re-word	Agreed at eting
10.	Page 4-8, PSU agrees with the Approach to Master Plan and Proposed Table of Contents for Master Plan, however the proposed contents for Master Plan are appropriate for Inception Report. When the actual Master Planning exercise initiated the comprehensive Table of Contents shall be prepared and shared with PSU for input.	No action needed	Agreed at meeting
11.	Page 4-7 Task (iv) discussion required to investigate existing house connections, do we need to carry out this exercise through surveys, or this information can be ascertain from Municipalities office.	BCE team currently in discussion with PSU on this issue. BCE may propose that the TMAs be asked to expose a number of house connections –for our Water Engineer to inspect and evaluate for a status report.	This action was agreed at the meeting

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

*in association with:*



12.	Revision of Work Plan 6.1 is required considering PSU comments provided as comment # 03.	As (3) above. BCE say that the Work Plan has to be updated to reflect the true situation.	Agreed Work Plan to be updated from mid-January 2012.
13.	Para 7.1.2 PSU, paragraph number 02, the Directors Position is not vacant on the date of submission of report- please correct.	BCE will correct	Agreed at meeting
14.	Table 7.4, proposed adjustments of Man months provided but the difference of the cost remuneration is not in report; justification for the proposed increased Man months of Team Leader is required.	BCE will modify as requested. The proposal for increasing team leader input is based on the need for a larger than expected coordination role.	BCE agreed to provide more justification for the proposed increase of two months for Team Leader input. BCE will also insert USD remuneration figures into the relevant Section 7 table
15.	The overall quality of Inception report is satisfactory; BCE understands the TORs and suggest fair methodology to perform the tasks.	Noted	No action needed
16.	<b>General Observations</b> At some instance the Inception reports suggests that SCIP 3 is hired for advisory services to support PSU & Urban Unit. This may be corrected to reflect the actual scope of services after modification of TORs and Scope of Work, which is: Program Management, Project Preparation and Implementation Support. The title of Inception Report should also be changed to reflect so	BCE will correct	Agreed BCE to action

# SINDH CITIES IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT  
SUPPORT FOR P&D DEPARTMENT

Bungalow No. D-45, Clifton Block-1,  
KDA Scheme No. 5, Karachi (Pakistan)  
Tel: 021-99251263-4, Fax: 021 99251265

in association with:



17.	In Table 2.5 item 6 (Social Survey Reports), the comments column says “PSU request”. The consultants must realize that submission of this report is required as per ToRs, whether PSU requests or not!	BCE will modify the sub-section in question	BCE agreed to modify
18.	Similarly for Item no. 10 (Assets Inventory Survey), consultants say: “Extra report asked for by PSU”. Consultants may kindly define “Extra”!	BCE will modify the sub-section	BCE agreed to modify
19.	Item 14 concerning Draft Sub-Project feasibility reports identify a maximum of 18 subprojects. The Consultants should elaborate on the basis for this claim/assumption?	With six towns and three subsectors there would in theory be a maximum of 18 subprojects	PSU agree, but noted that in practice the number of subprojects will be less; for example by combining landfill sites for some towns.
20.	Para 3.2.3 say “Chief Engineer” (line 1, p 3-2). This may be corrected as Chief Minister.	BCE will correct	Agreed at meeting
21.	Para 3 of section 3.3.1 is quite confusing. Kindly clarify.	BCE will correct	Agreed at meeting
22.	Para 3 of Task A1(i) say PC – II, this may be corrected as PC – I.	BCE will re-phrase	Agreed at meeting
23.	The consultants should elaborate on their role in task A1(ix) (b). “Conduct of annual poverty audits in Tranche 1 communities” and any work done in this regard by the consultants hired by NSUSC.	BCE will modify the sub-section. The audits relate to gathering data on the low income communities so that project impact can be assessed. BCE’s role is to oversee sub-consultants to gather the information and feed it into the M&E Framework	BCE’s M&E Specialist explained at meeting: <i>‘The Quantitative Baseline Poverty Assessment (QBPA) is anticipated to be completed as well as reviewed by the end of April 2012. The first poverty audit in both clusters will be conducted in April 2013, a year after the baseline. The design and methodology of poverty audits will be very similar to the QBPA; however, the</i>

			<i>coverage of poverty audit surveys will be limited compared to the baseline’ . This was accepted by PSU</i>
24.	For task A2 (iii), the consultants seem to be fixed on the idea of proposing a suitable management contract after reviewing the Punjab Cities Model. They need to be more proactive in this regard, such that even if Punjab model does not become available in time, they should be able to propose an appropriate model.	BCE take the view that as the Punjab model is mentioned in the TOR it should be valid. But our sub-section in any case makes reference to bringing in examples from around the world. We therefore the section stays as-is.	PSU explained that due to lack of investment there has been no significant progress on the Punjab Cities model referred to in the Terms of Reference.  BCE therefore agreed to seek appropriate examples from other parts of the World
25.	Page 4-8 says, DMA Zoning. What is this?In section 7.2.3 the consultants say: “This would be consistent with the “agreed” hybrid form. Agreed must be replaced by Proposed hybrid form.	BCE consider DMA (District Meter Area) to be an accepted term, and an important one. It is a logical way to assess needs and the best method for later on in the process to manage pressure and leakage management. BCE will also be highlighting the importance of NRW.	PSU agreed at meeting to BCE approach
26.	In section 7.2.3 the consultants say: ‘This would be consistent with the ‘agreed’ hybrid form’. ‘Agreed’ must be replaced by ‘Proposed hybrid form’.	BCE will re-phrase	Agreed at meeting
27.	Reimbursement to BCE shall be based on actual requirements to complete. Mobilization advance may be required and 10% finance charges will apply on the provincial sums. Please elaborate and justify	The BCE statement below Table 2.4 is directly in accordance with the new Terms of Reference. Please refer to Appendix E, Out of Pocket Expenses – foot-note.	After discussion, PSU agreed to BCE’s comments, subject to confirmation by ADB.

---

## MEETING RECORD

---

**Date:** 1<sup>st</sup> December 1, 2011, 11.00AM

**Location:** Conference Room, PSU Office

**Purpose:** Presentation of BCE's Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy

**Present:**

Mr. Abdul Kabir Kazi	- Program Director, PSU
Mr. Rafique Mustafa Shaikh	- Deputy Program Director, PSU
Mr. Mumtaz Ali Halepoto	- Urban Development Specialist (UDS), PSU
Mr. Muhammad Khalid	- Municipal Services Specialist (MSS), PSU
Ms. Moomal Shahab	- Engineering Assistant, PSU
Mr. Peter Griffiths	- Consultant's Team Leader (TL)
Mr. Amjad Habib	- Consultant's Deputy Team Leader (DTL)
Mr. Farhan Sami Khan	- Consultant's Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Specialist
Mr. Saeed-uz-Zafar	- Consultant's Municipal Delivery Specialist/Low-Income
Unit	Advisor

**Prepared by:**

Amjad Habib/Farhan Sami Khan/PMG

**Minutes Distribution:**

All participants, BCE, SMEC, EGC Lahore

---

**Discussion Points:**

*BCE's M&E Specialist, Mr Farhan Sami Khan, made a Power Point presentation of slides illustrating his proposals for inclusion in a draft M&E Strategy Report which is under preparation. The main purpose of the presentation was for BCE to obtain PSU feedback for inclusion in that report.*

**1. Presentation: Baseline Surveys, IPPMS and Reporting**

1.1 BCE's Team Leader explained that the presentation session was designed to obtain feedback from the PSU on the approach of BCE's Monitoring & Evaluation Specialist to M&E strategy. The data obtained will be incorporated into a draft version of our M&E Strategy Report, which BCE planned to submit within two weeks.

1.2 BCE's M&E Specialist Power Point slides covered the following headings:

- Background
- Components of SCIP
- Core objectives of SCIP's M&E Framework
- M&E Flow Chart with Specific roles and responsibilities
- Objectives of Types of Baseline Surveys including discussion on design, sampling, and survey methodologies for each baseline
- Various sample size options in two scenarios: (i) If population size is unknown, and (ii) If population size is known (estimated/extrapolated data)
- Tentative timeframe for baseline studies
- Investment Program Performance Monitoring System (IPPMS)
- Service Delivery Key Performance Indicators for IPPMS
- SCIP Monitoring and Reporting Mechanism and M&E Reporting Flow Chart

1.3 Following a PSU query on its accuracy, BCE agreed to update the urban population of Sindh. PSU said that the population was closer to 25 million people.

- 1.4 BCE's M&E Specialist agreed to revise the M&E Strategy Flow Chart to include the submission of baseline reports.
- 1.5 It was agreed that the length of the QBPA/socio-economic household questionnaires should be shortened, although it was agreed that both long and short formats offer advantages as well as disadvantages. BCE's M&E Specialist said that this questionnaire will be designed to meet the data requirements of the baseline study.
- 1.6 It was agreed that the monitoring of NSUSC by PSU needs to be incorporated in the M&E strategy; NSUSC's reporting mechanisms to PSU is to be incorporated.
- 1.7 BCE's M&E Specialist said that BCE's DTL will take the lead in designing the baseline questionnaire relating to 'Present Status of Physical Implementation'. PSU's Municipal Services Specialist agreed to provide BCE with the necessary data, including Tranche I sub-projects disbursement.
- 1.8 BCE's M&E Specialist said that the baseline survey for TMA Institutional Capacity and Infrastructure Support will incorporate the USC's capacity in this respect.
- 1.9 BCE agreed that the KPIs of all IPPMS are required to be systematically arranged, many KPIs having further sub-components. These will be incorporated in the IPPMS by BCE. For the SWM sector, it was noted by BCE that the volume of refuse collected daily will be included as a KPI.
- 1.10 It was agreed that that future USCs will collect periodic monitoring data for central Sindh towns
- 1.11 PSU's Urban Development Specialist agreed to provide BCE with the baseline survey formats for customer satisfaction designed by the SCIP-06 consultant.

## **2. General Discussion Points**

- 2.1 BCE and PSU agreed that it is important to have a select list of baseline survey firms as soon as possible. This will be achieved by the use of adverts in national newspapers, a system already agreed by PSU. BCE to submit draft adverts for PSU review as soon as possible.
- 2.2 PSU's Program Director noted that BCE's MSD/Low Income Unit Specialist, Mr Zafar, had been mobilised from 28 November for two weeks for the main task of producing questionnaires for the baseline surveys. He asked BCE to submit draft copies of questionnaires completed to date by 3<sup>rd</sup> December.
- 2.3 PSU's Program Director said that the early mobilisation of BCE's Contracts & Procurement Specialist is of paramount importance - as without him bid documents cannot be produced and baseline (and mapping studies) cannot proceed. He said that both activities are on the critical path, leading eventually in 2012 to a PFR and the securing of ADB funding for Tranche 2. He added that the deadline for obtaining this ADB approval is December 2012.

BCE's Deputy Team Leader explained that a new CV for a good Karachi based candidate had recently been obtained, and that he was waiting for EGC Lahore to give their approval. Once this agreement is obtained, BCE will submit this CV, together with a CV for a Mr Chaudhry (which PSU had previously said looked acceptable) to BCE for review and submittal to P&DDs CSC.

The Program Director said that if BCE can deliver the CVs to PSU by 3<sup>rd</sup> December, he will set up a CSC meeting for the following week.

2.4 BCE's Team Leader made a point in connection with the PFR. He said that a Summary Subproject Appraisal Report must be produced – in a format agreed by GOS and ADB – and submitted for approval by ADB. Once approved, a PFR may be prepared and submitted by GOS for ADB financing.

PSU's Program Director said that PSU will bring in a firm to check that the Summary Subproject Appraisal Report produced by BCE meets the required standard for submittal to ADB.

2.5 The Program Director said that a new GOS 'town' designation system had recently been enacted such that 'towns' applied where populations are below 50,000, and the designation 'municipalities' applied in the population range 50,000 to 500,000. Municipalities are governed by municipal committees. BCE noted that in the case of the central Sindh second cluster towns all will be municipalities (this to be confirmed as the selected towns have yet to be formally named).

2.6 PSU agreed to write to the Government of Sindh to obtain data on establishing the demarcation of urban and rural areas in the participating municipalities.

2.7 The Program Director said that PSU are keen to move towards contracted out management at the USCs.

**The meeting was closed at 3.00PM**



